ADDENDUM (G. [2] 2.14

* FIRST DRAFT *

WORKING GROUP 4 SUB-COMMITTEE 3

THE ADMINISTRATIVE, PRACTICAL AND LEGAL EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION

DISCUSSION DOCUMENT BY BOPHUTHATSWANA

1. INTRODUCTION

Bophuthatswana in its position statement on the future of the TBVC-States, suggested an investigation by CODESA into various future options and an objective evaluation of the likely implications resulting from such options. The opportunity was also asked to assess freely and objectively the merits and demerits of each proposal before the will of the people is tested.

The undertaking was given that every option which promises a better future, or a future at least as good as the present situation, will be regarded a feasible and realistic option for consideration.

CODESA on its behalf, instructed Working Group 4 in its Terms of Reference, "to investigate and report upon <u>all</u> proposals and make recommendations with regard to the relationships between South Africa, the TBVC-States and the people of those states under a new South African constitution".

Working Group 4 continued in this spirit to explicitly state that the effects on re-incorporation and non-incorporation should be investigated by the various Sub-Committees.

Although re-incorporation into South Africa may be a foregone conclusion for Ciskei, Transkei and Venda, it became obvious that the people and Government of Bophuthatswana is not convinced that it would be to their advantage to be re-incorporated.

Because of this reasoning, Bophuthatswana selected two options of non-incorporation as their first preferences. The option of a Regional Government within South Africa was identified as a third option for consideration.

An important part of the Terms of Reference of this Sub-Committee is therefore to investigate these implications further and provide the necessary documented proof if consessus is reached, that it will be to the advantage of Bophuthatswana and South Africa to join forces.

2. PROGRESS

It is clear from deliberations and information presented, that the TBVC-States cannot be generalised as a group, but that each individual state should in fact be evaluated as a specific entity in terms of its own unique performances and circumstances.

This resulted in a decision that detailed information according to an approved format, should be presented by each of South Africa, Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Ciskei and Venda. Most of these countries presented their information in terms of the approved format and are now awaiting a report on information still outstanding.

It is crucial for Bophuthatswana to have a clear analysis and balance drawn up of all positive and negative implications and effects on incorporation and non-incorporation for its specific situation.

The initiative to obtain clarity on this all important aspect, was therefore taken by way of a detailed analysis as attached, in ANNEXURE A, for consideration and discussion. This is still a draft presentation and is mainly based on existing and available information to date. A final report is intended for attention of Working Group 4 and even CODESA II, after finalisation by this Sub-Committee.

It is further important to note that many issues identified, require a specific statement of clarity or confirmation before the position can be accepted as final. It can therefore be accepted that this document and its annexure will require further refinement as further information is gathered and clarity is obtained regarding the specifics of a new constitution and its regional structures.

It is thus considered important that this Sub-Committee investigate all issues identified and provide further guidance to be taken into consideration. There-after, the discussion can be documented in the report to Working Group 4. This Working Group could then clarify outstanding issues, and confirm the conclusions and recommendations formulated and undertakings given for verification of the Management Committee and CODESA II.

In preparing the analysis in ANNEXURE A, it was accepted as a best case scenario for re-incorporation, that a regional government with maximum devolution of autonomy and powers is possible. If not, this should be clearly stated. Similarly, it was accepted that Bophuthatswana will be allowed to continue unhindered as an independent country if it choose to remain autonomous. Furthermore, existing cordial and constructive relations with a new South Africa will continue as at present.

If this is not going to be the position, this must also be stated and motivated clearly.

It is obvious that the conclusions and findings of this draft analysis will have to be reviewed and adopted if these two basic premises are not acceptable as a point of departure.

3. CONCLUSIONS

From the analysis provided, it is obvious that each government should be assessed separately and on merit regarding the likely effects and implications in a new South Africa. General guidelines and undertakings will have to be followed with more detailed understandings reached with each specific country.

The economic analysis and available information show without any doubt that the average resident in Bophuthatswana is enjoying a quality of life and access quality service by government, that compares to a favourably with anything offered in South Africa at In fact, it is obvious that present. there is apparently very little to gain administratively and financially from re-incorporation.

In exchange for these doubtful prospects it would appear as if several sacrifices are required from the average resident, as listed in the detailed analysis. [ANNEXURE A].

In summary, the following examples apply:

 An existing, proven and sound constitution must be replaced by a new constitution still to be developed as part of the negotiation process. It is not clear how principles and values of the government will be carried forward in such a constitution.

- Development attention will initially be focussed on the deprived areas of South Africa to the detriment of further growth and development in the relatively prosperous Bophuthatswana areas. All which has been gained in Bophuthatswana in comparison with the economic degradation in the bordering regions and towns in South Africa, will be lost again.
- The violence, killings and intimidation in South Africa will spill over into Bophuthatswana territory where peace, stability and economic progress were experienced the past years.
- Bophuthatswana's access to revenue sources and its fiscal autonomy to spend the money where the greatest needs are experienced and priority developments could be supported, will severely be limited.
- Political, economic and financial autonomy will largely revert back to a central government without the perspective nor appreciation for the needs and aspirations of the people living in this part of the country.
- The transfers of the functions and responsibilities to regional and local governments without access to revenue and the authority to take decisions, is a sure way to kill initiative and lose support.
- Although economies of scale are possible and provide exciting apportunities for the future, this must be weighed against the advantages of direct access and attention to grassroots and community needs and aspirations. Guidance on this must be given.

- There is a real danger that all good economic and administrative performances by Bophuthatswana will now be emptied in a bottomless pit of debts, shortfalls, poverty and basic needs experienced by the other populations in South Africa. Assurances and guarantees on this aspect is required before re-incorporation becomes a realistic alternative.
- Wrong constitutional, economic and financial policies in South Africa and TBVC countries, is further creating a financial burden and loss of confidence in the ability of South Africa to solve its internal problems.
- Very little respect and recognition is furthermore found at CODESA and in statements by some of the participants, regarding existing constitutions, acts, values and principles applied by ruling governments. This, together with examples where the merits of an argument is subject to political pressure and positioning, do not offer favourable prospects for a future South African Government.
- The way in which existing agreements and the peace accord are also interpreted and applied by the very signatories of these agreements, and the continued use of private armies, violence and intimidation, contribute to the existing despair on what a new South Africa holds.

From the above, it is obvious that considerable debate and guidance on all contradictory signals are required before reasonable expectations about the future can be created. Furthermore, specific assurances and guarantees on the future of the people, the assets and the structures of existing governments, its resource base and functional responsibilities will be required, before even a remote opportunity is created for a favourable consideration of a re-incorporation option.

D W SCHOEMAN

THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA. (ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCIAL AND PRACTICAL)

ANNEXURE A

.

EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION			EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION		
	POS.	NEG .		POS	. N
	= ====	====		=====	= =
	= ====	====		= ====	= =
	*		Very good economic performances	*	
		*		1	
		*	Much smaller economic base		
	1	*	Favourable interstate comparison with other		
	*		countries in Africa	*	
		*	Already reached a standard of living that is		
	*		higher than the average in SA in many respects	*	
Effluent society with high wages and consumption			Fourteen years of experience gained available to		
ability	*		plough back	*	
Open borders with neighbouring areas	*		Already a workable policy in place that stood test		
Access to international funding	*			*	
Good infrastructure and service structure to support			Public structure and level of service superior to		
development	*		most other countries	*	
Sustainable growth in companies available for investment	*		Attention is focussed on a smaller and more		
Inward looking and consumption based economic policy		*		*	
Large public sector involvement in economy		*			
		*		*	
				*	
forward		*	Relative peace stability and justice to all	*	
Dangerous political transition in period of economic			Racial harmony and focus on building of one nation		
decline		*	Strong value system entrenched in constitution		
Unequal distribution of income and resources		*	Tswana as one of official languages		
				*	
				*	
			Strong focus on the youth	*	1
		*	training	*	
		*		*	
Culture of violence and unrest difficult to change		*	Substantial decrease in population growth rate	Ţ	
		*	Good access to infrastructure and services	1	
	Much larger economy to benefit from Very low economic growth rate Future dependant of the outcome of negotiations Very high unemployment Large revenue base for government expenditure Spending priorities not the neighbouring SA regions A diversified economy Effluent society with high wages and consumption ability Open borders with neighbouring areas Access to international funding Good infrastructure and service structure to support development Sustainable growth in companies available for investment Inward looking and consumption based economic policy Large public sector involvement in economy Damaging fiscal policy Very large burden of apartheid policy to be carried forward Dangerous political transition in period of economic decline Unequal distribution of income and resources Large pressure on wealth distribution Hilitant youth with unreasonable expectations Financial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVC states is expected to be a drain on available funds Inferior education could have serious implications Serious decline in level of services over past years Culture of violence and unrest difficult to change	POS. ************************************	POS.NEG.Huch larger economy to benefit from*Yery low economic growth rate*Future dependant of the outcome of negotiations*Very high unemployment*Large revenue base for government expenditure*Spending priorities not the neighbouring SA regions*A diversified economy*Effluent society with high wages and consumption*ability*Open borders with neighbouring areas*Access to international funding*Good infrastructure and service structure to support*development*Sustainable growth in companies available for investmentInward looking and consumption based economic policyLarge public sector involvement in economyDanaging fiscal policyVery large burden of apartheid policy to be carriedforwardDangerous political transition in period of economicdeclineWilitant youth with unreasonable expectationsFinancial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVCstates is expected to be a drain on available fundsfinancial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVCstates is expected to be a drain on available fundsfinancial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVCstates is expected to be a drain on available fundsfinancial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVCstates is expected to be a drain on available fundsfinancial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVCstates is expected to be a drain on available fundsfinef	POS. NBG. Wuch larger economy to benefit from Very low economic growth rate Puture dependant of the outcome of negotiations * Very low economic growth rate * Puture dependant of the outcome of negotiations * Very low economic growth rate * Spending priorities not the neighbouring SA regions * A diversified economy * Effluent society with high wages and consumption ability * Open borders with neighbouring areas * Access to international funding * Good infrastructure and service structure to support * development * Inward looking and consumption based economic policy * Large pressure on wealth distribution * Neeline * Dangerous political transition in period of economic decline * Unequal distribution of income and resources * Large pressure on wealth distribution * Financial needs of Selfgoverning territories and TVC * Very large burden of apartheid policy to be darin on available funds * Strong value system entrenched in constitution * <tr< td=""><td>POS.NEG.Wuch larger economy to benefit from Very low economic growth rate Future dependant of the outcome of negotiations Very high unemployment Large revenue base for government expenditure Spending priorities not the neighbouring SA regions A diversified economy*Very good economic performances * * **Billity Copen borders with neighbouring areas Access to international funding Good infrastructure and service structure to support development**NEG.Sustainable growth in companies available for investment Inward looking and consumption based economic policy Large public sector involvement in economy Damaging fiscal policy Very large burden of apartheid policy to be carried forward Dangerous political transition in period of economic decline*NEG.*********************************</td></tr<>	POS.NEG.Wuch larger economy to benefit from Very low economic growth rate Future dependant of the outcome of negotiations Very high unemployment Large revenue base for government expenditure Spending priorities not the neighbouring SA regions A diversified economy*Very good economic performances * * **Billity Copen borders with neighbouring areas Access to international funding Good infrastructure and service structure to support development**NEG.Sustainable growth in companies available for investment Inward looking and consumption based economic policy Large public sector involvement in economy Damaging fiscal policy Very large burden of apartheid policy to be carried forward Dangerous political transition in period of economic decline*NEG.*********************************

2

THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA. (ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCIAL AND PRACTICAL)

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION	Inca	lumo	EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	
	Disintegration of Black family life Detoriated social fabric in white communities Large ethnical diversity and different cultures Active trade union movement Sanctions still not completely lifted Confused norms and value system still to be resolved Negative investment climate untill clarity on future dispensation is obtained Relative high standard of living in Bophuthatswana will not easily be met in foreseeable future Average resident in the country therefore not likely to benefit soon from incorporation Given the unclarity over future not adviseable to take a final decision overhasty Growth in Bophuthatswana relative to economic degradation in bordering areas of SA will stagnate	POS	* * * * * * *	Participant in many agreements with SA Limited investment opportunity Considerable leakages of funding an1 labour Weak export base Dependancy on limited sectoral base Public sector involvement in economy is high Dependance on skills and expertise from SA Heavy reliance on financial assistance from SA Limited revenue base Not protected enough from negative influences from SA Fragmented land blocks Unneccessary duplication of services and structure Still viewed as product of apartheid in spite of evidence to the contrary	

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION			EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	
		POS.	NEG.		POS
LABOUR HYSICAL INFRASTRUCTURE ROADS	No need for further land transfers All residents subject to compulsory RSA citizenship Unless stated otherwise, schemes to force existing land- owners from land can be expected Unless stated otherwise, affirmative actions to favour certain population groups at the cost of other Increased activity in large and politically motivated trade unions More and wider selection of employment opportunities A labour force known for low productivity and considerable loss of productive manhours A relatively higher wage structure in operation No compulsory scheme for employers/employees to provide for pensions Farm workers and domestic servants not yet recognised in labour legislation Labour legislation in need of review Education and training out of step with modern needs Not enough funds to maintain allready surfaced roads Rural roads need urgent attention throughout country	*	* * * * * *	Outstanding land transfers to continue Bilateral negotiations for more land and technical corrections will continue Citizenship will remain a free choice People will remain free to own and sell land as they wish All population groups will be equally treated with respect to land claims and services offered Less employment oportunities and smaller selection Smaller and more disciplined trade unions focus- sing on labour related issues Loss of productive manhours negligible and limited primarily to the mining sector Labour legislation allready provide protection to farm and domestic workers Advanced dispute resolution procedures in operation Education and training much more advanced and applicable than in South Africa National Provident Fund in operation for more than 10 years to provide for the eldery/disabled Government spending per capita higher than in SA General standard of road network superior than SA average Proximity to SA surfaced and national network also	* * * * * * * * * *

THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA.

(ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCIAL AND PRACTICAL)

ANNEXURE A

.

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION	POS.	NEG.	EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	POS.	NEC
ELECTRICITY	Access to good sources of water supply Provision of clean water in rural areas is a major challenge Major problems are encountered to collect tariffs Improved access to reticulation services in towns Major source of electricity supply Access to big coal resources Advanced structure to supply the total sub continent Major problems in collection of tariffs Improved reticulation of services in towns Considerable improvement in telephone facilities is likely Improvement in private telephone connections possible Superior provision of postal services in Bophuthatswana will not be improved soon Interference in radio and TV services can be expected Access to improved maintenance of service	* * * * * *	* *	Dependant on bulk water supply from SA Reticulation of water in rural areas superior to the average SA situation In position to give higher priority to water supply than would be otherwise the situation Polution of water not a big problem Do not experience problems with collection of tariffs and fees Dependant on SA for electricity supply Duplication of structures to supply electricity Limited access to coal/energy reserves Collection of tariffs not a problem Tremendous need for affordable energy in area Not the funding base to support big investments Higher per capita expenditure on these services will continue Larger number of postal services could ensure an superior service in future The provision of adequate telephone services is a problem Technological expertise requirred not readily available Can continue its independant broadcasting and TV service	**** * * *	

THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA.

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION			EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	
		POS.	NEG.	.	POS
SOCIAL INFRASTRUCTURE HOUSI	Is a second s		* * * * * *	tribal areas Towns reasonably provided with basic infrastruc- ture Effective and efficient local/tribal authorities Although backlogs are experienced no rental boycot Local authority legislation in process of comp- pletion Continued inflow of people to escape the violence in SA	
TRANSPORTATI	ON Transportation in rural areas very bad Very heavy subsidy burden on the government Reluctance to pay transport fares		* *	years for SA to match Increases of tariffs are less of a political instrument and budgetory constraint Manufacture own buses that are required	
EDUCATI	ON Become part of school unrests in SA Children to be subject again to inferior education system and bad matriculation results Superior teacher to pupil ratio will deminish Superior classroom to pupil ratio will diminish Improved enrolment rate will have to wait for SA to catch up		* * * * *	The provision of technical/vocational training will continue to receive priority System of entrepreneurial/small farmer training will continue	
HEAD	TH Improved access to doctors Improved access to nurses Improved access to hospital beds Improved facilities and funding	* * * *		Superior level of services/clinics in rural areas will stagnate untill rest of SA caught up	

ef	fec	t1.	CAL	
~		••••		

1 THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA.

(ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCIAL AND PRACTICAL)

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION	Inca	Intro	EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	PC
SOCIAL WELFARE More so Improve No accee LAW AND ORDER Large s Violence	ore social workers/1000 population mproved level of public old age benefits o access to National provident fund arge security risks in SA iolence and crime rate unacceptably high	POS.	NEG.	National Provident Fund allready in operation Larger strain on budget to catch up backlog Internal stability Superior ratio of police and level of services	P0
	Number of policemen/capita inferior to present position No benifits in terms of magistrate offices Less police stations per 1000 people More prisoners per 1000 population Better prisoners/bed ratio Ombudsman function only recently introduced	*	* * *	will be maintained for the future Ombudsman allready in operation for 10 years Continued application of sound policy and strategy	
	E Improved renumeration and benefits Further rationalization of positions and staff An unhealthy big public service Renumeration expenditure more than 30% of budget Participation in undercovered pension schemes Transfers of staff throughout SA Adaptation to new policy and regulations New legislations to be administered At disadvantage compared with existing staff in SA Unless stated otherwise,PSC act and services will become redundant Unclear and lengthy communication structures	*	* * * * * * * * *	Staff compliment to continue as before Renumeration still less than in SA Proportion of budget less than 30% Continued training and development of staff Very healthy pension scheme for public servants Staff transfers only within Bophuthatswana borders Existing and known legislation Short and direct communications with decisions Uniformity in application of policy and procedures	5
PARASTATALS	Severe rationalisation of parastatals Large numbers of employees will become redundant Economy of scale will apply Loss of direct and short communication links Many existing and new projects to be postponed Superior level of services to residents to await rest of country to catch up Loss of direct communication with parastatals	*	*	of existing organizations Continued services of high quality to residents Continuation of existing and new projects Improved future and security for employees Direct contact with grassroots needs	

8 THE EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION AND NON-INCORPORATION ON BOPHUTHATSWANA. (ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCIAL AND PRACTICAL)

DESCRIPTION	EFFECTS OF RE-INCORPORATION	POS.	NEC	EFFECTS OF NON-INCORPORATION	POS	NE
		=====	====	 ====================================	= ===	= ==
FINANCES	Loss of Customs and Excise revenue Loss of autonomy on the use of budgetory assistance from Central level, unless otherwise stated Unclarity on basis of future financial transfers from Central level Unless stated otherwise, no claim to individual taxes paid by citizens in SA Unless stated otherwise, no transfer of company taxes paid to Central Authority New double taxation agreements to be entered into Unless stated otherwise, loss of control over mining taxes Unless stated otherwise, loss of control over mining taxes Unless stated otherwise, loss of VAT as revenue source Fiscal autonomy over other revenue sources to be conside- rably restricted Less revenue to fund functions and needs Introduction of higher marginal tax rates for individuals Autonomy to raise loans to be restricted considerably Strong indications that revenue generated in area will be transferred to other communities Motivation for increased revenue collection not there Training of staff and community to collect taxes according to new and strange legislation Complete chaos in implementing new policies and rates Access to new sources of revenue at regional service/local level New guidelines on central/regional/local revenue sources to be developed Overborrowed according to IMF standards Debt servicing ratio unacceptably high Access through Central government to Foreign aid		* * * * *	Continued access to Customs and Excise transfers Continued honouring of bilateral agreements on financial transfers Continued budgetory assistance from SA Continued DBSA funding of projects Complete fiscal autonomy over revenue sources Continued lower marginal rates for individuals Highly motivated collection of revenue Trained staff and known legislation Access to loan funding Flexibility to apply deficit financing in budget- ting Very low exposure to loan funding at present Very low debt servicing ratio Existing debts will remain responsibility of the government	* * * * * * * * * * * *	

ANNEXURE A

.

YOUNG SA FOUNDATION / JUNG SA STIGTING

WORKING GROUP 4, SUBCOMMITTEE 3 MEETING: 23-03-1992.

Land moratorium:

The meeting reaches consensus on the following in regard to the above subject,

265 PØ2

14

Assonaria

- that no further attempts be made to identify new Land for transfer to the TBVC Governments.
- that Land currently in the possession of the S.A. Development Trust should remain in the hands of the Trust until its dissolution, whereafter it will be transferred to the S.A. Government (Successor in title).
- 3. that the moratorium should apply to all land listed in the Schedule to the Borders of Particular States Extension Act 2 of 1980 which has not yet been exised from South Africa.
- 4. that this moratorium will apply to all SATBVC States.

However, the meeting notes the concern of the South African Government and National Party delegations about certain legal and contractual obligations which have to be fulfilled as well as land purchased by the S.A. Development Trust from individual South African citizens which has not yet transferred.