

MOHON-122-2-1

**FINAL REPORT
COMMISSION ON
NATIONAL SYMBOLS**

Commission
on
National
SYMBOLS

19 OCTOBER 1993

INDEX

1.	Report from the Commission on National Symbols	1
2.	Minority Reports	
	National Flag	31
	National Anthem	32

REPORT FROM THE COMMISSION ON NATIONAL SYMBOLS:

19 OCTOBER 1993

1. INTRODUCTORY

- 1.1 The Commission on National Symbols appointed by the Negotiating Council on 7 September 1993, had to contend from the outset with contradictory factors within its mandate. Members of the Commission were reminded that they would be addressing "an extremely emotional issue that will have to be dealt with utmost sensitivity" and that proposals for a national flag, a coat of arms, a seal and an anthem for the constitution for the transitional period were to be invited from "all interested persons or parties". Both these matters presuppose careful and time-consuming deliberations and creative processes. Yet the Commission was requested to present its recommendations to the Negotiating Council before the end of October 1993, thus allowing the Commission some six weeks only from its first meeting to achieve these goals, while the artists had barely a month in which to prepare their submissions.
- 1.2 Despite these daunting circumstances, the Commission is of the opinion that this enterprise yielded valuable insights and significant submissions, on which it could base its recommendations.

2. THE PROCESS

- 2.1 During the first meeting of the Commission on 15 September 1993, an invitation for submissions to the Commission on National Symbols in the three categories, National Flag, Coat of Arms, National Anthem, was drafted and dispatched to all parties listed in the directories of the Multi-Party Negotiating Process. Moreover, letters were dispatched to universities, technicians and approximately 24 000 schools. The following introductory remarks were added to the invitation, to emphasize the need for maximum participation:

2.2 "The process of eliciting submissions for a national flag, coat of arms and anthem should be inclusive in order to ensure that they are truly representative. All the people of South Africa, groups and individuals, in both urban and rural areas, are invited to participate. Proposals are invited from all interested persons and parties and local leaders should assist in the process. Participants should be drawn from all walks of life including the following kinds of groupings: schools, religious, cultural, civic, local, youth, women, students, stokvels, specialist societies, e.g. musical, heraldic and vexillological."

2.3 At the request of certain members of the Commission the appointment of facilitators was approved in regions where it was feared that the invitation would penetrate with difficulty.

2.4 The closing date for submissions to the Commission was set for 13 October 1993. The Commission categorised themselves into the following Sub-Committees:

2.4.1 National Flag:

- * Prof T Sirayi (Convenor)
- * Ms L Gilfillan
- * Mrs P Maluleka
- * Mr F Brownell
- * Dr C Pama

2.4.2 Coat of Arms:

- * Mr F Brownell (Convenor)
- * Dr C Pama
- * Prof P Kapp

- 2.4.3 National Anthem:
- * Dr M Xulu (Convenor)
 - * Prof F Meer
 - * Prof CJ Reinecke

- 2.5 The chairman was an ex officio member of all Sub-Committees. Dr Pama and Mr Brownell were unable to play any meaningful role in the Sub-Committee on the Flag (on account of their involvement in the Sub-Committee on the Coat of Arms).
- 2.6 Professor Sirayi and Ms Gilfillan joined the Sub-Committee on the Coat of Arms at a later stage.
- 2.7 At a meeting on 28 September a Sub-Committee for Publicity, comprising the chairman and convenors of Sub-Committees, was established to ensure that the activities of the Commission be more widely publicized, especially on regional radio services.
- 2.8 On 28 September 1993 it was also decided that representatives from the Foundation for the Creative Arts, Federated Union of Black Artists, Association of Community Art Centres in South Africa, and the National Arts Initiative would be nominated to act as assessors advising the Commission, thereby attempting to deal with the problem of limitations to public participation induced by time constraints.
- 2.9 On 14 October these assessors joined the Commission to scan the exhibits of submissions at the World Trade Centre, and for listening sessions with the Sub-Committee (National Anthem).

2.9.1 Assessors to the Sub-Committee on the Flag

- * Mr P Matlua
- * Mrs B Leburo
- * Mr L Seage
- * Ms M Martin
- * Dr Odendaal
- * Mr T Stylianides
- * Mr B Berry
- * Mr D de Waal

2.9.2 Assessors to the Sub-Committee on the Coat of Arms:

- * Dr F Frescura
- * Mr T Nkotse
- * Prof T Msimang
- * Prof H du Toit

2.9.3 Assessors to the Sub-Committee on the Anthem:

- * Mr P Buthelezi
- * Ms M Coertse
- * Prof J Khumalo
- * Mrs S Mgcina

2.10 The assessors in no way usurped the Commission's responsibility in decision-making, but rather assisted in identifying dominant features and significant trends in the submissions for a national flag and coat of arms, while commenting on matters of suitability and musical qualities for a national anthem.

3. THE NATIONAL FLAG

3.1 In accordance with the recommendations of the Commission to establish Sub-Committees, a Sub-Committee for the national flag was established as follows:

- * Prof T Sirayi (Convenor)
- * Ms L Gilfillan
- * Mrs P Maluleka
- * Mr F Brownell
- * Dr C Pama

3.2 The brief of the Sub-Committee was to co-ordinate the submissions of the national flag and assist the Commission with the evaluation process.

3.3. The Sub-Committee prepared the guidelines which were adopted by the Commission on 28 September 1993.

3.4 In accordance with the position of the Commission's decision to establish a group of Assessors, the following were invited:

- * Dr F Frescura
- * Mr T Nkotsi
- * Prof T Msimang
- * Prof H du Toit

3.5 Recommendations

The Commission wishes to point out that these submissions are to be regarded as no more than proposals for an interim flag. The submissions are not representative in terms of the racial groupings in South Africa and much greater public involvement is required before a flag is designed for the country. The people should be drawn into the process more extensively. The time frame was extremely short and some entrants were unable to meet the deadline. Final decisions were being made while designs were still coming in.

The process was as follows: a first shortlist of 130 entries was compiled from the 7000 entries; a second shortlist of ten followed and from this the final selection of six designs was made. The designs are listed in order of priority; the first design is regarded as superior to the other five.

3.5.1 Design 1

This is a design, combining ideas from two entries.

The dominant colours of green and gold reflect the overwhelming preference for these colours in the 7000 submissions. They also place the flag in the African context, both with regard to the colours of flags of the continent and the maps of Africa. Gold signifies wealth, resources, and sun; green the environment, the land, vegetation, fertility, growth and youth.

The vertical motif of triangles represents the people and is associated with indigenous decorative forms. It is a stylised version of a recurrent motif of reconciliation in the submissions. The motif signifies interlinked people, unity, harmony and balance. It is simple and anybody will be able to draw it. The colours on the triangles are green, blue (rain, water, sky) and red (courage, progress, vitality, blood); the line separating them is white (peace, hope, reconciliation, understanding).

The irregularities of the white line in between the triangles are to remain; they are crucial to the aesthetics and significance of the design and impart an organic quality to the motif.

The manufacturing of the flag has been discussed and considered and found viable.

3.5.2 **Design 2**

An indigenous design with sun; the white frame is not part of the flag - the background is blue.

3.5.3 **Design 3**

The design is acceptable but the horizontals have to be separated by a white line.

3.5.4 **Design 4**

The triangle from hoist to fly indicates movement culminating in a point in the future; black lines are to be omitted. This design is similar to that of the flag of Guyana.

3.5.5 **Design 5**

The flag is divided horizontally, the top third being red, the lower two thirds blue. The red and blue are divided by a thin white stripe; three upward pointing green triangles are separated from the blue by a white serrated stripe.

3.5.6 **Design 6**

Red and black stripes are separated by a yellow serrated stripe in the top third of the flag; the lower two thirds comprise a downward pointing yellow triangle on a blue background.

4. THE NATIONAL COAT OF ARMS

4.1 Brief to the Commission on National Symbols:

Part of the brief to the Commission on National Symbols was that it should put forward suggestions to the Negotiating Council on at least four coats of arms and a seal for South Africa for the transitional period.

4.2 The Nature of a National Coat of Arms

A national coat of arms is the graphic representation of the identity of the state. As such it appears on the Great Seal, coinage, official documentation, other instruments of State. Unlike the national flag, the national coat of arms is not used by the public at large. The present national coat of arms was granted to the Union of South Africa by Royal Warrant in 1910 and retained unchanged when South Africa became a republic in 1961.

4.3 Guidelines to the public

4.3.1 The principal guideline given to the public was that the national coat of arms should be unique and representative of the country and its people.

4.3.2 In the interests of the widest possible public participation certain basic principles relating to the design of both a flag and a coat of arms were drawn up and distributed.

4.3.3 Despite the widest possible public participation having been invited, only 81 designs for a national coat of arms and seal were received in the allotted time, in contrast to the approximately 7 000 proposals received for a national flag.

4.3.4 The designs submitted for a national coat of arms fell into three broad categories:

4.3.4.1 approximately two thirds are of a traditional heraldic nature. In almost 80% of these, the shield used is of the European type, while an indigenous African-type shield is proposed in slightly more than 20% of the submissions;

4.3.4.2 a quarter of the designs received fell outside the traditional heraldic framework, although some of these were in the nature of a seal; while

4.3.4.3 slightly less than 10% of the submissions are based on the present national coat of arms.

4.3.5 Of the written submissions received on the question of the coat of arms, nearly 80% were either for the retention of the present national coat of arms, at least for the transitional period, or cautioned against over-hasty change. The remainder felt that the national coat of arms should change.

4.4 Guidelines for the evaluation of designs

In the guidelines for the evaluation of the draft designs of the coats of arms, it was agreed by the Commission that internationally accepted heraldic practices will need to guide the Commission on a choice of designs to be submitted to the Negotiating Council.

4.5 Assessment of designs

4.5.1 Outside assessors, who were appointed to assist the Subcommittee, evaluated the designs received and submitted individual but divergent reports. It has not been possible to reach consensus on the content of these reports.

4.5.2 There are, in essence, two divergent viewpoints:

4.5.2.1 In the first of these, it is felt;

- * that heraldic principles, which are of European origin, are not entirely relevant in the South African context;
- * there was a feeling among those holding this view, that some other symbol, within another heraldic conception, might be more appropriate for South Africa.

4.5.2.2 The other viewpoint is that in putting forward proposals for a national coat of arms appropriate to South Africa, traditional European heraldic principles should be followed.

4.5.3 Out of the deliberations held between the members of the subcommittee and the assessors who were appointed to advise it, five designs were identified for consideration by the Commission. Three of these designs were of a traditional European heraldic nature, one contained heraldic elements which could be refined, and the fifth could be described as an emblem. A number of countries use a state emblem instead of

a coat of arms.

4.5.4 In respect of these designs, the sub-committee proposed possible amendments for further consideration by the Commission.

4.5.5 The Sub-Committee also extracted from the designs submitted certain ideas which were then incorporated into new composite designs.

4.6 Draft designs received / prepared by the Commission

4.6.1 In compliance with the mandate received from the Negotiating Council, the following draft designs are attached hereto for consideration. It is regretted that the time-frame within which the Commission has had to operate, has made it impossible to have final art-work prepared of the alternative or composite designs.

Reflecting the divergent views of members of the commission and its assessors, these submissions are divided into two categories.

4.6.2 First Category

4.6.2.1 Design A

This is a composite design. Although placed within the traditional heraldic framework of shield helmet, crest, wreath, mantling and supporters, it represents a clear break with the elements contained in the present South African national coat of arms.

The green and gold shield bear only one change, the Protea cynaroides, South Africa's national flower.

The leopard supporter, which were suggested as being Southern African symbols of authority, are not in their national colour but in black and white which links up with a Zulu proverb: "The leopard licks its spots - black and white", which implies equality and non-discrimination.

The bound staves in the crest, symbolic of the binding together of the people and regions of South Africa, the number of which can obviously be adapted, is placed within a protea wreath suggesting a blossoming new South Africa.

The designer of one of the proposals on which this design is based, has recommended the retention of the motto EX UNITATE VIRES as being entirely appropriate for the new South Africa.

4.6.2.2 **Design B**

This arose from discussions in the sub-committee and, like the first design, is based on proposals submitted by the public.

The oval shield, reminiscent of the shape of many African shields, is supported by two guineafowl which, with their black and white colouring, are considered to be representative of the country's people. African-type shields have been freely incorporated into South African heraldry, so this concept is nothing new.

The contents of the shield are derived from suggestions received from the public and could obviously be changed if it is felt that something more appropriate is required.

In a coat of arms of this nature a helmet and mantling would be inappropriate but a crest, placed upon a traditional African headdress, could be added. A suitable motto would be placed on the riband beneath the shield.

4.6.3 **Second Category**

4.6.3.1 **Design C**

This design, which incorporates a European-type shield, the content of which is open to further suggestion but at present incorporates the colours blue, white and green, has draped on either side colours which should link up with those of a new national flag which must be chosen.

Above the shield is placed half a round gold sun surrounded by a black cogwheel.

A suitable motto would appear on the riband beneath the shield.

4.6.3.2

Design D

This design, which has a strong indigenous appearance, also utilises a shield of European shape. The composition of the design within the shield would need to be refined to comply with heraldic requirements. Placed above the shield is half a round gold sun, superimposed on which is half a black cogwheel. Resting on the sun is an indigenous motif. The shield is placed between two maize plants representing the staple food of much of South Africa's population.

4.6.3.3

Design E

This design, which is circular and thus more in the nature of a seal, incorporates elements from a number of designs submitted to the Commission. The green and gold allude to South Africa's natural resources and wealth, while the guineafowl with its black and white colouring is considered to be representative of its people. The gold ring is symbolic of wholeness, unity and continuity. It is geometrically perfect, and is thus one of the concepts of the Deity. It is the shape of the

negotiating table and therefore of democracy. The South African indigenous homestead is also circular, and thus the circle becomes symbolic of the family. It is the place where the Elders/Representatives of the group meet to debate the affairs of the community.

If this emblem were to be used as a seal, it would be necessary to include an appropriate circumscription, as is customary on a seal, on the ring surrounding the central motif.

4.7 Coats of Arms in Second Category

(Submitted by Prof T Sirayi)

4.7.1 Preamble

4.7.1.1 It must be remembered that the existing coats of arms in South Africa and the homelands have their origins in Great Britain and the Netherlands.

Carl Alexander von Volborth states that "in South Africa there is a mixture of Dutch and British Heraldry".

4.7.1.2 The Dutch and British heraldic tradition generally require that a national coat of arms comprise:

- * a shield of European type
- * supporters that are animals
- * a crest

- * a helmet
- * a motto below the shield

4.7.1.3

It has generally been the practice of countries that liberated themselves from Europe or oppressive powers to abandon European heraldry; for example:

- * "American countries liberated themselves from their European domination and developed new forms of heraldry influenced by revolutionary symbols... This is the reason why their coats of arms are oval in shape."
- * "France is another example of a country that abandoned traditional European heraldry."
- * "The Soviet Union also has an altogether different coat of arms from that of Tsarist Russia, the change of the social order being documented not only symbolically but also by inscription."
- * "Not even the arms of Italy comply with heraldic requirements."
- * "The countries of Asia also differ in their arms from the concepts of European heraldry."
- * "In Canada there is a mixture of British, French and Native Canadian heraldry."

- 4.7.1.4 In short, it has become a modern and accepted trend, as well as recognised international practice, to have a coat of arms which is:
- * without a shield, e.g. France, Italy, Romania, China, Japan, Ethiopia;
 - * without supporters as animals e.g. Japan;
 - * without a crest e.g. Japan, Israel, Iran, Italy, certain American countries;
 - * with oval shaped arms e.g. South American countries, Guinea Bissau, Mozambique;
 - * with circular arms e.g. Japan, Mauritius, Madagascar, Taiwan, China, Bangladesh.

At this stage it is important to note C.A. von Volborth's observation: "The shield can take practically any form, depending on period, place, function, situation..."

4.7.2 **Motivation**

Coats of arms in this category are recommended because:

- 4.7.2.1 They are unique and original;
- 4.7.2.2 They follow international practice regarding liberated countries;
- 4.7.2.3 They graphically document the new social order and encapsulate the historical, social and political condition peculiar to South Africa;

4.7.2.4 They signify the abandonment of the old order as reflected in colonial, apartheid and bantustan heraldry.

4.8 Motto

Of the 40 mottoes submitted for consideration, members of the Commission recommend the following four in order of priority:

- (a) UBUNTU (Humanism)
- (b) EX UNITATE VIRES (Unity is Strength)
- (c) CONCORDIA RES CRESCENT (Growth Through Agreement)
- (d) CONJUNCTUS VIRIBUS (With United Powers)

4.9 Further refinements of some or more of these designs can be prepared if the Negotiating Council so wishes.

4.10 It is essential that any new national coat of arms which might be chosen should, in addition to being heraldically correct and appropriate, also be aesthetically pleasing.

4.11 Another option which the Negotiating Council may also wish to consider, is to leave the question of a new national coat of arms in abeyance until the Interim Government takes office.

4.12 This would provide the Interim Government with the opportunity to indicate the direction it feels that the design of this important instrument of State should take and the preparation of new designs can, if necessary, be taken from there.

4.13 Great Seal

4.13.1 The Great Seal is a country's supreme symbol of authority, being used to seal, and thus certify, important State documents.

4.13.2 The seal is customarily circular, with a circumscription around the rim indicating whose seal it is. If a country has a coat of arms or other state emblem, this appears in the centre of the seal.

4.14 Those countries which do not have a coat of arms or State emblem, would use a depiction of the seal in lieu of another form of heraldic identity.

5. THE NATIONAL ANTHEM

5.1 Background

According to the recommendations made by the Commission on National Symbols about a possible future national anthem for the interim constitutional period, the following guidelines were agreed upon:

- * The anthem should express and promote national unity.
- * The composition should be original and submissions should be accompanied by lyrics in any of the languages of South Africa, by sheet music and/or demonstration tape.
- * It may be submitted in staff notation or tonic solfa.

These guidelines were made known to the South African public when it was invited to participate in the process through press releases, media interviews, advertisements and correspondence.

The Sub-Committee compiled additional guidelines for the evaluation of the submitted anthems:

5.2 Evaluation

5.2.1 The Text or Lyrics

- 5.2.1.1 The text or lyrics must be evaluated separately.
- 5.2.1.2 The test or lyrics must promote national unity.
- 5.2.1.3 The lyrics must be unique and original.
- 5.2.1.4 The lyrics must be in any of the South African languages including the languages of the TBVC States.
- 5.2.1.5 The lyrics must be given a South African context and relate to the fact that South Africa is a country in Africa.
- 5.2.1.6 The lyrics must not be about a particular period in history, nor must they promote a history of any particular section of the South African population.
- 5.2.1.7 The lyrics must promote a common South African nationalism.
- 5.2.1.8 The lyrics must promote the idea of a common South African culture.
- 5.2.1.9 The lyrics must move all South Africans irrespective of race, colour, creed or gender into a new common ground.

5.2.1.10 The lyrics must promote patriotism, a South African identity, a South African solidarity, a loyalty to South Africa, God and fellow countrymen.

5.2.1.11 The lyrics must promote a sense of pride.

5.2.2 **The Music**

5.2.2.1 The music must be simple.

5.2.2.2 The melody must be derived from South African melodies, i.e. indigenous African or syncretic African/Western.

5.2.2.3 The music must reflect a musical meeting point between Africa and the West.

5.2.2.4 The melody must be singable by all people, without requiring any musical training.

5.2.2.5 The melody must be memorable.

5.2.3 **The Song**

5.2.3.1 There must be correlation between the lyrics and the music.

5.2.3.2 Speech tones and stress points must relate to time and metre.

5.2.3.3 Tempo must preferably not be fast.

- 5.2.3.4 The song must be harmonized in four parts, or orchestrated.
- 5.2.3.5 The song must be singable by choir or an assemble of many people, even thousands together.
- 5.2.3.6 Complicated and minor harmonic progressions must be avoided.
- 5.2.3.7 A voice and piano score may be submitted.
- 5.2.3.8 The song must be uniquely South African and about South Africa, that is, it must not generalise about Africa or the world.
- 5.2.3.9 The song must be derived from South African music, preferably folk music, and must be in line with performance systems presently found in South Africa, e.g. choral.

Further, the Sub-Committee envisaged that the whole process of involving South Africans in the making of the nation's new anthem would take place in the following manner:

5.2.4 **The Process**

- 5.2.4.1 Composers and members of the public who so desire may:
- * Compose a new anthem;
 - * Write and submit lyrics only;
 - * Collaborate in cross-cultural music;

- * Make re-arrangements of existing anthems and national songs;
- * Make other types of submissions and suggestions in writing, to the Commission.

5.2.4.2 Composers who have composed new music or have made new arrangements and wish to record with a choir or ensemble will be assisted with arrangements to record.

5.2.4.3 Recorded music together with lyrics written on a separate sheet of paper may then be submitted to the Commissioner in the region.

5.2.4.4 A TDK cassette can be submitted as demonstration tape.

5.2.4.5 A composition may be in tonic solfa or staff notation.

5.2.4.6 Submissions may include the name and address of the person/s or organisation if they so wish.

5.2.4.7 Anonymous submissions are welcomed.

5.2.4.8 The Commission on National Symbols reserves the right to use such elements from the proposals as it deems fit in submissions to the Negotiating Council.

The Sub-Committee set itself the following objectives and deadlines to facilitate the process of evaluation:

- * All submissions would be evaluated;
- * Criteria laid out in the main guidelines above would be used;
- * A group of music specialists would be invited as assessors, to assist the Sub-Committee on 14 October 1993;
- * The assessors would make recommendations to the Sub-Committee who would then make presentations to the full Commission for evaluation on 15 October 1993.

This process took place as originally planned and agreed upon.

5.2.5 Public Participation

Members of the Sub-Committee invited various composers, musicians and lyricists to participate in the making of an anthem for the transitional period.

5.3 Emerging Viewpoints

There are five viewpoints that emerged around the issue of a new anthem for South Africa.

- 5.3.1 There is a strong lobby that "Die Stem" be maintained as a national anthem for the transitional period in South Africa. Some argue that, with a few adaptations and changes to the text, "Die Stem" could be made acceptable to all South Africans.

- 5.3.2 There is a strong lobby that "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" should be recognised as a national anthem for the transitional period in South Africa. Some proposed that with a few changes to the text and the removal or re-adaptation of the Sotho part, "Nkosi" can be made acceptable to all South Africans.
- 5.3.3 There is a strong lobby for both "Die Stem" and "Nkosi" to be officially recognised anthems for the transitional period until either one of them becomes generally acceptable or both disappear in favour of a new national anthem for a new South Africa.
- 5.3.4 There is a strong lobby for something totally new, a new national anthem which will be without a history and therefore able to play a unifying role. This school believes that because of their respective histories, which are characterised by confrontation and polarisation, neither "Die Stem" nor "Nkosi" would pass for a broadly accepted national anthem.
- 5.3.5 Some argue that a new national anthem be composed and regional states who feel they would like to recognise either "Die Stem" or "Nkosi" or even their own new songs as additional regional anthems should do so.

All arguments were well supported.

5.4 Submissions

- 5.4.1 By 14 October 1993 there were already 119 entries for an anthem for the transitional period, including "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika". All 119 entries

were evaluated by the Sub-Committee and assessors on the same day.

5.4.2 At the end of the listening session there was general agreement among members of the Sub-Committee and assessors that six new entries and both "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" could be short-listed for final selection.

5.4.3 The following compositions were shortlisted:

- * Volkslied - by composer Nico H Buitenweg in Afrikaans.
- * God Bless Africa - by composer E Smith in English.
- * Anthem of Life - by composer W Loubser in English.
- * God Bless South Africa - by composer Pal Roebert in English, Afrikaans, Sotho.
- * Vunwe - by composer S J Khosa in Tsonga and English.
- * Die Volkslied - by composer A van Wyk in Afrikaans, Tswana and English.

5.4.4 The four assessors evaluated the shortlisted submissions independently on a form that was provided. They took into consideration the following points:

- * Patriotic potential of the song.
- * Unifying potential of the song.
- * Nation-building potential of the song.
- * South Africanness of the song (in terms of its music).
- * The ability of the song to promote the idea of a common South African culture.

- * The singability (simplicity of the melody) of the song.
- * Musical structure of the song:
 - Form
 - Melody
 - Rhythm
 - Harmony
- * Evaluation of the authenticity of the song.

5.4.5 The assessors were unanimously that although the six songs shortlisted were good, none of them could really pass for an anthem. They had various technical deficiencies, especially in musical structure and form, and some lacked originality and authenticity.

5.4.6 The assessors suggested that since they could not find an acceptable new anthem, "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" and "Nkosi" be sung as dual anthems during the transitional period. They also suggested that adaptation of the texts should be considered where necessary, and that the texts of both songs should be translated into the various languages of South Africa to allow the songs to be used by as broad a community as possible.

5.6 Recommendations

The Commission recommends:

- 5.6.1 That the music of "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" and "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period. The Commission further recommends that the Negotiating Council consider translations, adaptations and standardisation of the lyrics of these songs, where necessary.

5.6.2 That the composition and lyrics for "Vunwe" composed by SJ Khosa be considered by the Negotiating Council as an alternative. Various translations suitable to the music should be considered.

5.6.3 That the Negotiating Council be urged to promote a process whereby further submissions for anthems for a new South Africa be elicited. The whole exercise of searching for a new anthem should be seen as a lengthy process which is in its initial phase, and while the songs to be submitted to the Negotiating Council for consideration would be for the transitional period, composers should generally be encouraged to continue with their work of composing an anthem for a new South Africa. The Commission also recommends that such a process should be sustained by the government of the day or any new government after elections.

5.7 Comments

5.7.1 Some of the submissions, lyrics and music merit recording and popularising and the Negotiating Council should consider ways and means of implementing this.

5.7.2 The Commission further recommends an educational drive aimed at:

5.7.2.1 Encouraging the general acceptance of the anthems by the whole spectrum of the South African public.

5.7.2.2 Popularising the anthems through radio, television and other media, including publishing.

5.7.2.3 A Committee to this end should be appointed by the Negotiating Council to sustain and to monitor the process.

6. Further Recommendations.

- 6.1 The Commission set in motion a process heightening the awareness and strengthening the notion of a collective South African identity. However, it is the Commission's considered opinion that much more time and effort are needed for this awareness to manifest in effective and more permanent national symbols, to make the South African public generally aware that we are moving towards common ground.
- 6.2 The Commission was particularly disturbed by the very poor participation. Although every effort was made to ensure as wide a public participation as possible within the severe time constraints, the process of informing and consulting the public could not attain the necessary momentum. It is also feared that there will not be sufficient opportunity for the broad population to become familiar with, debate and identify with the Commission's recommendations.
- 6.3 The fact that symbols are seen as "transitional" and therefore temporary has already created some uncertainty among the public, and this hampers the vital and essential process of public identification with the symbols. Furthermore, there are wide-ranging practical implications in the implementation of new symbols.
- 6.4 The Commission regards it as being of vital importance that the momentum gained in the present quest for national symbols be sustained through the immediate establishment by the Negotiating Council of a similar body or cultural forum to conduct and monitor ongoing processes; to invite broader public debate; to conduct further surveys and research on public reaction to

the Commission's recommendations; to initiate campaigns to educate the public about new symbols and to popularise proposed symbols as an integral part of nation building; to stimulate creative participation with special reference to the national anthem by means of competitions, music and choral festivals; to establish the role of regional symbols in a future dispensation.

- 6.5 The Commission wishes to express its appreciation to all members of the public who participated in this important initiative.

**MINORITY REPORT ON THE PROPOSED NATIONAL FLAG,
SUBMITTED BY PROF PH KAPP**

I support designs 1, 3, 4 and 5 but not numbers 2 and 6 for the following reasons:

1. Number 2 is unacceptable to me because it represents a rather strange design for a flag and reminds me too much of the Red Cross symbolism.

2. Number 6 is unacceptable to me because it creates the impression of a gift wrap and the symbolism ascribed to the different colours (for example black representing energy and red suffering) is not acceptable. Colours are neutral and any forced effort to give a symbolic meaning to it, is not justified.

MINORITY REPORT ON NATIONAL ANTHEM

(Addendum to minority report)

We agree that both Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika and Die Stem be accepted during the Interim Period. However, in view of the fact that the words of Nkosi accord with the guidelines and those of Die Stem infringe on six of these, the words of Nkosi only should be sung, followed by the playing of a stanza of the music of Die Stem. Die Stem:

- * does not promote national unity (5.2.1.1)
- * it reflects on the history of a particular section of the South African population (5.2.1.6)
- * it does not promote a common South African nationalism (5.2.1.7)
- * it does not promote the idea of a common South African culture (5.2.1.8)
- * it does not move South Africans into a new common ground (5.2.1.9)
- * it does not promote a South African identity or a common patriotism (5.2.1.10)

This proposal is made to compromise knowing full well that the majority of the South African population favour Nkosi.

This proposal was accepted on Friday 15 October but in the absence of some members, it was changed on Monday. There are, thus, strong grounds for its reinstatement. We therefore, through this minority report, seek to re-instate this option.

Furthermore, we request the Council to mount an intensive campaign to ensure the fullest participation of the South African people in the process of deciding on a National Anthem.

15 Friday final copy (after amendments)

COMMISSION ON NATIONAL SYMBOLS REPORT BY THE SUB-COMMITTEE ON THE NATIONAL ANTHEM.

CONVENOR: Dr Musa Xulu

15 October 1993

BACKGROUND

According to the recommendations made by the Commission on National Symbols about a possible future national anthem for the interim constitutional period, the following were guidelines agreed upon:

- * The anthem should express and promote national unity.
- * The composition should be original and submissions should be accompanied by lyrics in any of the languages of South Africa, by sheet music and or demonstration tape.
- * It may be submitted in staff notation or tonic solfa.

These guidelines were made known to the South African public when it was invited to participate in the process through press releases, media interviews, advertisements and correspondence.

The sub-committee further gave itself the following guidelines for the evaluation of the submitted anthems:

EVALUATION

1.1 THE TEXT OR LYRICS

- 1.1.1 The text or lyrics must be evaluated separately.
- 1.1.2 The text or lyrics must promote National unity.
- 1.1.3 The lyrics must be unique and original.
- 1.1.4 The lyrics must be in any of the South African languages including the languages of the TBVC States.
- 1.1.5 The lyrics must be given a South African context and relate to the fact that South Africa is a country in Africa.
- 1.1.6 The lyrics must not be about a particular period in history, nor must they promote a history of any particular section of the South African population.
- 1.1.7 The lyrics must promote a common South African Nationalism.
- 1.1.8 The lyrics must promote the idea of a common South African culture.
- 1.1.9 The lyrics must move all South Africans irrespective of race, colour, creed or gender into a new common ground.
- 1.1.10 The lyrics must promote patriotism, a South African identity, a South African solidarity, a loyalty to South Africa, God and fellow country men.

1.1.11 The lyrics must promote a sense of pride.

1.2 THE MUSIC

1.2.1 The music must be simple.

1.2.2 The melody must be derived from South African melodies, i.e. indigenous African or syncretic African/Western.

1.2.3 The music must reflect a musical meeting point between Africa and the West.

1.2.4 The melody must be singable to all people, without requiring any musical training.

1.2.5 The melody must be memorable.

1.3 THE SONG

1.3.1 There must be correlations between the lyrics and the music.

1.3.2 Speech tones and stress points must relate to time and metre.

1.3.3 Tempo must preferably not be fast.

1.3.4 The song must be harmonized in four parts, or orchestrated.

1.3.5 The song must be singable by choir or an assemblage of many people, even thousands together.

1.3.6 Complicated and minor harmonic progressions must be avoided.

1.3.7 A voice and piano score may be submitted.

1.3.8 The song must be uniquely South African and about South Africa that is, it must not generalise about Africa or the world.

1.3.9 The song must be derived from South African music, preferably folk music and must be in line with performance systems presently found in South Africa, e.g. choral.

Further, the sub-committee envisaged that the whole process of involving South Africans in the making of the nation's new anthem was going to take place in the following manner:

THE PROCESS

2.1 Composers and members of the public who so desire may:

2.1.1 Compose a new Anthem

2.1.2 Write and submit lyrics only

2.1.3 Collaborate in cross-cultural music

2.1.4 Make re-arrangements of existing Anthems and National songs.

2.1.5 Make other types of submissions and suggestions in writing, to the Commission.

2.2 Composers who have composed new music or have made new arrangements and wish to record with a choir or ensemble may contact SYLVIA BRIGGS - TEL. 011 397 1198 for arrangements to record.

2.3 Recorded music together with lyrics written on a separate sheet of paper may then be

- submitted to the Commission in the region.
- 2.4 A TDK cassette can be submitted as demonstration tape.
 - 2.5 A composition may be in tonic solfa or staff notation.
 - 2.6 Submissions may include the name and address of the person/s or organisation if they so wish.
 - 2.7 Anonymous submissions are welcomed.
 - 2.8 The Commission on National Symbols reserves the right to use such elements from the proposals as it deems fit into submissions to the Negotiating Council.

The sub-committee set itself the following objectives and deadlines to facilitate the process of evaluation:

1. All submissions would be evaluated.
2. Criteria laid out in the main guidelines above would be used.
3. A group of music specialists would be invited to come in as Assessors, to help the sub-committee on 14 October 1993 at the World Trade Centre.
4. The Assessors would make recommendations to the sub-committee who would then make presentations to the full Commission for their evaluation on 15 October 1993.

This process did take place as originally planned and agreed upon.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Members of the sub-committee got various composers, musicians and lyricists to participate in the making of an anthem for the transitional period.

EMERGING VIEWPOINTS

There are five types of viewpoints that are emerging around the issue of a new anthem for South Africa.

1. There is a strong lobby, that "Die Stem" may be maintained as a national anthem for the transition in South Africa. Some argued that with a few adaptations and changes in the text, "Die Stem" could be made acceptable to all South Africans.
2. There was a strong lobby that "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" should be recognised as a National Anthem for the transitional period in South Africa. Some people proposed that with a few changes in the words and the removal or re-adaptation of the Sotho part, "Nkosi" can be made acceptable to all South Africans.

3. There is a strong lobby for both "Die Stem" and "Nkosi" to be officially recognised anthems for the transitional period until either one of them becomes generally acceptable or both disappear in favour of a new National Anthem for a new South Africa.
4. There is a strong lobby for something totally new, a new national anthem which will be without a history and be able to play a role of unifier. This school believes that because of their history which is characterised by confrontation and polarisation, neither "Die Stem" nor "Nkosi" would pass for a broadly accepted national anthem.
5. Some argue that a new national anthem may be composed and regional states who feel they would like to recognise either "Die Stem" or "Nkosi" or even their own new songs as second regional anthems can do so.

All arguments were well supported.

SUBMISSIONS

By 14 October 1993, there were already 119 entries for an anthem for the transitional period, including "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika". All the 119 entries were evaluated by the Sub-Committee and Assessors on the same day at the World Trade Centre. Listening facilities were provided.

At the end of the listening session there was general agreement among members of the Sub-Committee and Assessors that six new entries and both "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika", could be short-listed for final selection.

The six new entries were:

1. Volkslied - by composer Nico H Buitenweg in Afrikaans.
2. God Bless Africa - by composer E Smith in English.
3. Anthem of Life - by composer W Loubser in English.
4. God Bless South Africa - by composer Pal Roebert in English, Afrikaans, Sotho.
5. Uvunwe - by composer S J Khosa in Tsonga and English.
6. Die Volkslied - by composer A van Wyk in Afrikaans, Tswana and English.

The four assessors evaluated the shortlisted submissions independently on a form that was provided. They took into consideration the following points:

1. Patriotic potential of the song.
2. Unifying potential of the song.

3. Nation-building potential of the song.
4. South Africanness of the song (in terms of its music).
5. The ability of the song to promote the idea of a common South African culture.
6. The singability (simplicity of the melody) of the song.
7. Musical Structure of the song:
 - 7.1 Form
 - 7.2 Melody
 - 7.3 Rhythm
 - 7.4 Harmony
8. Evaluation of the authenticity of the song.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE ASSESSORS

The following recommendations were made.

The Assessors were unanimously of the opinion that although the six songs shortlisted were good, none of them could really pass for an anthem. They had different technical deficiencies, especially in musical structure and form and some lacked originality and authenticity.

The Assessors suggested that since they could not find an acceptable new anthem, they recommended "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi" as dual anthems during the transitional period. They also recommended that adaptation to the text should be considered where necessary and that the text of both songs should be translated to the various languages in South Africa to allow the songs to be used by as broad a community as possible.

The original and adapted versions of both "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" will also be submitted to the Negotiating Council.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE

The sub-committee recommends:

1. That the music of "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period.
2. That the music of "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period, with in practice "Nkosi" being sung followed by the music of "Die Stem".

3. That the Negotiation Council considers adaptations to the texts of these songs where necessary, to be used with the music as recommended.
4. That the following compositions and lyrics should be considered by the Negotiating Council as suitable alternatives in the following order of priority:
 - (a) Uvunwe - by S J Khosa
5. That the Negotiating Council be urged to promote a process whereby further submissions for anthems for the New South Africa should already now be stimulated. The whole exercise of searching for a new anthem should be seen as a long-drawn process which has just begun and while the two or three songs to be submitted to the Negotiating Council for consideration would be for the transitional period, composers should generally be encouraged to continue with their work of composing an anthem for new South Africa. The Sub-Committee also recommends that such a process should be sustained by the government of the day or any new government after elections.

COMMENTS BY THE SUB-COMMITTEE

Some of the submissions, lyrics and music merit recording and popularising and the Negotiating Council should consider ways and means of implementing this.

The Sub-Committee further recommends an educational drive aimed at:

- (a) Encouraging the general acceptance of the anthems by the whole spectrum of South African public.
- (b) Popularising the anthems through radio, television and types of media, including publishing them.
- (c) Facilitating the formation and foundation of a new South African nationhood.

A standing Committee to this end should, by suggestion, be appointed by the negotiating Council, to give inputs and monitor the process.