214/3/2/3/7

CONSTITUTIONAL ASSEMBLY

THEME COMMITTEE 3

Ci

0

RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT

> SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

RECEIVED AS AT 20 MARCH 1995

VOLUME 5

Theme Committee 3

Summary of Submissions - Volume 5

ORGANISATIONS

 \cap

 \cap

Submiss.No.: 1 Summary : The Central government should concentrate on matters central importance eg. Defence, Justice, Foreign Affairs et and that all other issues of concern be dealt with by Provinci and Local authorities.	c.
Organisation :City of DurbanIndividual :O'Meara M.J. (Exec. Dir)Category :Provincial and Local government systemsSubmiss.No.:2Summary :All functions be devolved (deployed downwards) to the lower appropriate level of government, allowing Central government to concentrate on national issues. However, these Local authorities must ensure that the nation standards be upheld and exercised. Local authorities also establish and operate libraries locally with the funding from Central government. In order to promote payment for the provision of services; • incentives be introduced. • costs be collected from defendants. Lawyers working for the local authorities be allowed to carrie out conveyancing as this can be provided at lower costs. In summary the province of Kwazulu-Natal will have enormou demands on the public resources due to it's unique situation eg. the high rate of urbanisation, population and lack of essential services.	nt aal th ry us
Organisation :Communities of Ga-MothibiIndividual :Matlhako A.M.Category :Local government and DemarcationSubmiss. No.:3Summary :The organisation expresses disappointment that they were not consulted before being included, under the interim constitution into the North West Province.	

They oppose being in this province for the following reasons : - prior to bantustans these villages were under the district of Barkley West. They therefore see this arrangement as part of the "apartheid structures". - they have been serviced by the A.N.C. (Northern Cape) up till the elections. - majority of the people are working in the North Cape province - the distance between these villages and the capital of the North West (Mafeking) is too far compared to the Northern Cape (Kimberley). **Organisation**: Contralesa - Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa Individual : Nkosi N.P. Holomisa Category : Nature of Provincial and Local Government - argues for a House of Traditional Leaders Submiss. No.: 4 Summary : Recommend that the complete document be read. Traditional leaders to be more active on a Provincial level - to be entrenched in a House of Traditional Leaders. Leadership is to be independent of party affiliation. Constitutional Monarchies will be supported. Jurisdiction of Traditional Authorities followed by establishment of Rural Local Councils. District Councils should be formed to co-ordinate the provision of services and community development. Political counsellors and Traditional Leaders to sit on this district council which will be headed by the resident king. Contralesa has a detailed introduction and has contributed to other theme committees. **Organisation**: Unity Council for Undenominational Protestant and Pentecostal Churches of S.A. Individual : The Rev. J.M. Vosloo Category : **Provincial and Local government** Submiss. No.: 5 Summary : The submission undertakes that there should be different courts to hear different crimes (criminal and other). The Public service have it's own new autonomous body. Financial matters be handled by one department. There must be an Industrial court and arbitration for unions to avoid unnecessary strikes. Establish a Road department and transport to ensure better control over mini-buses and taxis and so reduce the cases of fatal accidents.

(

)

Organisation :

Institute for Advancement of Human Rights, Democracy and Individual Right to mother tongue and own culture and own land in S.A.

Individual : Category : Submiss. No.: Summary :

Provincial and Local government systems

6

This organisation proposes that elections be done on a **constituency basis** where candidates are elected on merit and not necessarily on party affiliation.

That regions and Local authorities have more **autonomy** to look at local interests.

That the advancement of cultures of different groups be incorporated to insure their survival.

That any person or organisation/ party found guilty of racialism be dealt with by the government and the laws

That punishment for violence against any race group or person be dealt with by the government for it's complete elimination.

That Affirmative action be eliminated from the constitution as this would eventually favour all Blacks and disfavour whites and other advantaged groups.

The constitution exclude Nationalism, Socialism and Communism as forms of economies.

That <u>local</u> expertise be used instead of using/ hiring from overseas with the intent of excluding/ discriminating against one or other race group.

The idea of the Truth commission be scrapped if the law cannot prove that the crimes committed by both sides were for political reasons.

There is also a strong case for considering that the past actions of the "white" government were strictly political in the same sense as those of the A.N.C.

The creation of a Volkstaat, White, Indian, Coloured, Zulu and tribal precincts.

The strengthening of the Zulu province be maintained and the whites and coloureds enclaves in the Western Cape.

Tribes must be allowed to develop their regions on a cultural basis if they do not want to be regimented into a Xhosa-A.N.C. culture.

The diversity of interests will also diminish/break a monopoly of one culture and so strengthen democracy.

The SABC and the Media must promote quality and merit rather than pushing politics, propaganda and brainwashing.

Regions for minority groups be allowed to have their own TV-RADIO and Newspaper which will ensure their cultural survival.

Organisation:	POPCRU
Individual: Category:	Sgt. P.M. Ntuli (Secretary of Popcru - North Coast) Accountability
Submiss. No.:	7
Summary:	A minister to control a each department which renders services.
	Central government to control security; safety; defence; finance; education; correctional services; justice. Provincial government to control regions with no autonomy to
	allow for appeal to central.
	Premiers to control chiefs, mayors, director-generals, but not the "king". The king to demarcate boundaries with chiefs.
	Provincial and local systems to run in accordance with the will of the people. Leaders should be accountable to the people and should be removed if they fail to deliver the goods.
Organisation: Individual:	Steelpoort Civic Association
	n/a Demarcation of boundaries
Category: Submiss.No.:	8
Summary:	The Steelpoort community wishes to fall under the Eastern
	Transvaal and not the Northern Transvaal.
Organisation:	Volkstaat Council
Individual:	n/a
Category:	Self determination / competencies - financial and fiscal
Submiss. No.:	9

INDIVIDUALS.

Individual: Seth G. Abrahams Category: Local Government - protection of arts and culture in rural areas Submiss.No.1 Summary: The rights of women and children should be protected, especially in the rural areas and w.r.t. arts and culture.

Individual: Anonymous

Category: Local Government - role/function of rural inspector/representative Submiss.No.2

Summary: She/he to:

mediate between farmer and tenants / farmworkers; raise standard of living; promote education and sport; town sport committees to include rural pupils in subsidized sport; upgrade teachers and place them on farm schools; support systems in place; minutes to be kept of all meetings; workers to be educated as to their rights; encourage computer literacy at school; tourist potential developed.

Individual: Anonymous

Category: General

Submiss.No. 3

Summary: The writer suggests that to simplify and speed up the process of open participation in the Interim Constitution; it would be easier if questionnaires are set up which "lay-persons" could relate to and understand and so complete voluntarily.

The person on the street usually has little knowledge about these matters but still feels to be part of the process.

Individual: D.O. Bowen

Category: Levels of government

Submiss.No. 4

Summary: It is submitted that the old/original S.A. constitution be used as a model for the new one, excluding of course the discriminating clauses.

A separate act be set up for matters falling outside the essential structure eg. Bill of Rights.

We must also restrict irrelevant matter as this would only lead to more litigation and time wasting.

It is further suggested that **Central** government have **more power** so as to ensure uniformity and the Provincial governments concentrating on issues of their own provinces.

Lastly it is felt that only the most suitably **qualified** persons be elected to parliament and that parties be abolished as they (parties) restrict the MP's initiative to forward the party's views.

Individual: I.R. Bruce

Category: Members of parliament and other officials

Submiss.No. 5

Summary:

The following issues are highlighted regarding officials :

- They be held **responsible** for their portfolios including resignation in the event of corruption or gross incompetence.

- They declare all investments in business operations and lodge all certificates and Balance sheets to an appropriate authority who should be empowered to investigate all or any aspects.

- The use of family members or nominees for investments be illegal.

- That any person guilty of any criminal offence, irrespective of indemnity, be ineligible to be elected to parliament or any public service post.

- A balanced **Disciplinary Committee** be established to investigate and take action against members found guilty of actions or behaviour involving racial matters or in any way bring parliament into disrepute.

Individual: C. Chevalier

Category: Provincial and Local government

Submiss.No. 6

Summary: Apart from entrenched democratic rights, we include a provision to guide future generations into adopting and upholding democratic attitudes towards others and require this as part of early education. Limited federal powers should be granted to provinces yet enough autonomy in matters of town planning, environmental control, cultural matters and tourism.

Each province should have an Administrator with executive committee appointed by the governing party.

The province should undertake responsibility for matters delegated and those assigned to it on an agency basis.

Local government should be undertaken by councillors elected on a ward basis.

The **Central government** should be able to contribute additional facets on a national basis in all matters, where deemed necessary.

Overhead costs should be kept as low as possible by electing only the minimum number of provincial councillors/representatives.

Individual: B. Deller

Category: Moratorium on capital punishment to be stopped; Accountability Submiss.No. 7

Summary: Anyone who has committed a criminal offence is disqualified from serving in a public office for a period of 5 years after s/he has served his/her sentence;

Capital punishment to be re-instated, especially for drug offenses and murder.

Bail as a right be revoked; Judge should have liberty to set any bail Drug dependants to be **supplied** with free, clean drugs.

Right of recall of public officeholders for misconduct.

No discrimination on any basis.

Individual: R. Daddy

Category: Provincial Government - retention of four provinces

Submiss.No. 8

Summary: Retain the four provinces viz. Cape; OFS; Transvaal and Natal. Amalgamate authorities where possible; Avoid duplication of services or staff.

Individual: S. Dalhazei

Category: Concurrency - Provincial legislative authority - competence w.r.t the environment.

Submiss.No. 9 and 10

Summary: A provincial legislature shall have concurrent competence with parliament to make laws w.r.t. the environment and nature conservation, excluding national parks, botanical gardens and marine resources, subject to an act of parliament which shall prevail over provincial law inconsistent therewith and subject to international treaty.

This letter is supported by one other in this volume and 47 others in volume 6.

Individual: N. Fumba

Category: Accountability - National System

Submiss.No.11

Summary: Accountability to central, provinces and people.

Proportional representation; no need for deputy-premier; TLC chairperson to be elected once, annually.

Individual: H.P. Gorringe

Category: Local/Provincial Government - Tax system

Submiss.No.12

Summary: Taxation may take the form of money or time.

Maximum rate at 30% for all, to be paid in money or time or both. Government expenditure to be limited

- large loans only to be taken after a referendum

Savings can only be made after being taxed;

therefore " no taxation on savings."

Insurance and crime prevention to join forces.

Policing agencies to be **accountable** to the community they serve. Office-holders appointed on merit only, **NO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION**. Industry, big business and small business to have non-political representation in the cabinet.

Individual: A.H. Hatting

Category: Maximum devolution of power to Local Government Submiss.No.13

Summary: " All Power, All Corrupts!"

- 1. Maximum devolution of power to local level on local issues.
- 2. Maximum devolution of power on regional issues to regional government.
- 3. Maximum ability to exercise power at central level on national/international issues.

Individual: R.A. Haw

Category: Local government boundaries

Submiss.No.14

Summary: Boundaries which are <u>imposed</u> upon communities lack the support of the people within them, and efficiency and success of the local authority is compromised.

The success of local governments largely depends on the **community development approach**, which encourages people to participate in the development and administration of their own areas.

The idea to make the peninsula a giant metropolitan area is not feasible because is not equated with neither efficiency or economy. Efficiency and economy is diminished in direct proportion as the chain of communication lengthens.

The present debate concerns the responsibility for the large squatter communities in the Western Cape, whose developmental needs are enormous. The R.D.P. will be operating to uplift these areas, but it must not be overlooked that there are resources within these communities that only await the enlightened policy of community development to unleash them eg. human energy, physical, financial and mental or entrepreneurial resources.

The people must be permitted to decide what their priorities are and with the help of "agents of change" (community development operatives) who are ready to assist and advise. When people make their own decisions they will naturally support their projects.

The Cape Town municipality and the fringe town administrations need not look on the squatter communities/areas with total foreboding.

There are dangers however, and that is the matter of deciding for and doing for, the communities which has **failed** before to foster human growth and real progress. To **encourage** local initiative and decisionmaking we have to subsidise whatever the community contributes and so get the ball rolling.

Individual: B.A.L. Hellryd

Category: Cabinet Ministries and Civil Service

Submiss.No. 15

Summary:

()

The new constitution must provide a clear distinction between the cabinet ministries and the central administrative agencies. The cabinet ministers should only deal with policy matters, prepare and propose legislation to parliament, answer questions, compile budgets and propose taxes. They should give general instructions to the administrative agencies.

Administration should be carried out by independent central agencies, operating within the framework provided by parliament. Civil servants should be appointed on merit and not for political affiliation.

15 cont...

Regional administrative bodies could be given the same status as the central agencies, in relation to the provincial governments.

The advantage of this division, in the first place, is to allow the ministers to concentrate on applying policy directives; for which their party was elected by the people, and secondly to spare them from involvement in petty squabbles and personal disputes.

The division also brings the advantage that central agencies will acquire great experience in their field and provide it with stability as well as continuance.

Individual: J.P. Knock

Category: Levels of government

Submiss.No.16

()

Summary: Checks and balances must be built into the constitution to oblige the largest party at provincial or national level to form coalition administrations, drawing on the expertise available across party lines in the interest of a good, stable and fully representative government. The social and political impact of long periods of one-party domination leads me to believe in the virtues of coalition governments.

Government for long periods by one party at provincial or national level will drive expertise away, and perpetuate confrontation, civil disobedience and a culture of non-cooperation.

The way MP's and MPP's were nominated on party lists and elected is a bad precedent as it excludes totally any form of accountability to anyone other than the political party, making it impossible to represent he views of the constituency.

Affirmative Action

There should be some sort of time scale after which time; a true meritocracy should be encouraged without race as a qualifying or excluding factor.

The period of adjusting the balance of all-white domains must have a finite dimension.

Representatives and Remuneration

A more realistic limit should be laid down in proportion to the population. Salaries should be adequate to guard against corruption but not so high as to make politicians rich and divorced from the people they claim to represent.

Individual: C. Levitt

Category: General

Submiss.No. 17

Summary: The f

- ary: The following are highlighted :
 - Acceptance and recognition of freedom of all religions.
 - Protection of the rights of minorities.
 - Checks and balances to be enshrined in the constitution.

- A justiciable Bill of Rights safeguarding all citizens.

- Provincial governments to be empowered with legislative enactments for citizens within their jurisdiction.

- Local authorities to take cognisance of grievances of the members of groups living within it's jurisdictional areas and to have certain powers to give effect to such structures.

 Non-racist, non-sexist classification of population groups applicable.
Affirmative action where qualifications and completed training merit such a policy and not merely for reasons of redressing past imbalances.

Individual: R.M. Longden-Thurgood Category: General Submiss.No.18 Summary: *Recommended that the entire document be read.*

Individual: J. Moroga

Category: Role of Local Governments

Submiss.No.19

Summary: Local elections to be open and voters to be well informed. People standing for office must reside in that area because they are better informed and motivated.

Individual: J. Mcetyna

Category: Role of Local Government

Submiss.No.20

Summary: Tough measures to combat crime. Employment and housing a priority.

Individual: W. Muhali

Category: Unitary State; Checks and Balances

Submiss.No.21

Summary: Unitary state ie. no provinces and no premiers because they are power-hungry; equality can't exist if we have different states.

Individual: A.N. Mphephu

Category: Nature of Government: Unitary State; Role of Traditional Leaders; Land Distribution; Crime.

Submiss.No.22

Summary: One country, One People - "Africans".

Chief to play a role in society, but not politics.

Central Government to control provinces.

Farming land allocated to competent people.

No private forces. STOP CRIME!

Individual: V.A. Naicker

Category: Minimum requirements for Public Office; Traditional leaders; Remuneration for ministers; Environment; Capital punishment.

Submiss.No.23

Summary: Basic academic qualification a prerequisite for public office. Appropriate candidates for portfolios eg. Minister of Health must be a doctor.

> Traditional Leaders should **not be recognised** - no authority. - cannot reconcile Western democratic principles with African Law. Ministers should receive less remuneration. Size of families to be **restricted**.

Government to be ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY. Death penalty to be maintained.

- Individual: G. Ngirane
- Category: Provincial Government: Titles / Death Penalty Submiss.No.24 Summary: The title " Minister " is to be used instead of MEC. Strong federal system to be incorporated; Provinces subordinate to central government; Provinces to be called " States " - increases pride; encourages decentralisation of industry and commerce. Capital Punishment to be retained.

Individual: Mishack M. Ntuli

Category: Nature/System of government - Strongly Central / Object to Tribal Authorities.

Submiss.No.25

- Summary: People in rural areas should first be consulted on their desire for, or recognition of Tribal Authorities. Tribal Authorities have caused many problems in rural areas.
 - Against Federalism Power to remain in Central Government - limits mismanagement and corruption.
 - U.I.F. is useless, should be optional/people consulted before their money is deducted.

Aid to underprivileged Black communities entrenched in Law.

Individual: Y. Olsen

Category: Provincial / Local Government - Independent of Central Government Submiss.No.26

Summary: Local government subject to Provincial government. Provincial government largely independent of Central Government except for taxes/levies.

Individual: M.I. Osborne

Category: Nature of Government - Obligations and Rights

Submiss.No.27

- Summary: Constitution to provide for obligations which will ensure that the rights of others are not impaired.
- Individual: E. Rasebitse
- Category: Provincial boundaries
- Submiss.No.28

Summary: That Transvaal be reinstated as a province.

Individual: W. Ridley

Category: Provincial Government

Submiss.No.29

Summary: Environmental protection against pollution be emphasised and waste generation be minimised.

Provincial legislature to have equal/concurrent competence with parliament to make laws with regard to the environment subject, which shall prevail over a provincial law inconsistent therewith.

Individual: P. Willis and D. Salters

Category: Levels of government

Submiss.No.30

Summary: Power be devolved to the lowest competent tier of government but still maintaining adequate standards.

Citizens have the right to call for a **referendum** with "x" number of signatures appended to a proposal.

Elected representatives may be recalled by their electorate by a motion to which "x" number of signatures are appended.

Individual: D. Sardi

Category: Composition of Wards on farms

Submiss.No.31

Summary: The farmer plus other workers and farm school teachers form the farm ward committee.

From all these people (surrounding farms) the Regional Rural local council is formed.

They in turn elect a Mayor, Rural clerk and their deputies plus one additional member to make up a five member management.

If more people are needed, they could come from unions, private sector and RDP.

Personnel for these councils can be deployed from central, provincial, or any other government structures instead of retrenching or allowing them off on early retirement.

Farms needs may include:

- Health care
- Para-legal resource centre
- Primary and Secondary schools
- Agricultural schools
- Sanitation and Water
- Food and nutrition

The constitution and Bill of Rights should not be silent on the need to have a **Civil society** forum with a management and council at all the levels (local to national).

The government should appoint a national and provincial facilitator, to be paid by central and provincial governments respectively.

Their task would be to facilitate meetings with the organs of the Civil society.

SANCO may be approached to recommend facilitators.

Individual: W. Schmidt Category: Local government Submiss.No.32 Summary: Better control and

y: Better control and punishment of financial institutions and managers with regard to fraud of citizens money.

Police not be allowed to remain based in small towns for long periods as they form associations and treat people differently and with hostility.

Local town councils be addressed for building expensive house for Town Clerk while there are other priorities such as roads and electricity.

Town clerk be accountable to the people and have less autonomy.

Individual: H. Smith Category: Local government Submiss.No.33

Summary:

Individuals, bound by group interests, be able to form associations without any prescriptivity from higher authorities.

These associations form negotiating forums to organise societies form ground level and so move upwards to regional, provincial and national levels.

Individual: Spero C.A.

Category: **Provincial government**

Submiss.No. 34

Women's Rights Summary:

> Women have the right to decide for themselves whether they wish to bear a child or not.

Make safe abortion available to women.

Women should not be forced to accept the multiple wife tribal laws as they are degrading to a woman's dignity.

Laws

The Death penalty be reinstated to reduce serious crime eg murder, armed robbery etc.

The high rate of crime affects tourism and foreign investment.

"A man's home is his castle"

No one should have the right to enter property including the police without a legal document authorising this.

No one should have the right to dispossess the lawful and legal owner of his/her property no matter what reason.

Reduce the number of members of the National Assembly to ten(10) per province.

This would reduce the cost of the country and ease the burden on the taxpayer.

Abolish the traditional Chiefs as they are merely hanging on and increasing costs.

Individual: E. Stott

Criteria for voting in Local Government Elections. Category:

Submiss.No. 35

Summary:

Everyone to pay tax, whether indirectly or directly in order to justify universal suffrage. Only property owners to qualify for voting rights in Local Government Elections.

Companies and foreigners who own land in a particular community, should also have the right to vote in local government elections.

Individual: Z.J. Tshounyane

Category: Traditional Leaders / S.A.N.D.F./ National Disaster Fund / Pre-schools / Broadcasting Act.

Submiss.No. 37

Summary: There should be a national SANDF to protect any province.

Actions by SANDF to be decided by committee on which S.A. communities and chiefs have representation.

There should be a S.A. National disaster Fund which can operate on provincial, national and international basis.

Education Department should construct sufficient pre-schools.

Miners to be employed on a permanent basis whereas foreigners are to be employed on contract basis.

Members of the public should be allowed to buy shares in regional broadcasting services.

S.A. House of Congress to be established.

Regional governments to have their own radio and television stations. S.A. to have federal system of government - regional governments have the power to administer their own finances.

Central government to be the protector of regional governments, also to monitor regional finances.

Traditional Leaders Act to be passed which will entitle traditional leaders to places in the Houses of Assembly, provincial governments and play a role in the drafting of the final constitution.

National boundaries to consider traditional leaders.

Provincial tourism board to be established with representatives on a National Tourism Council. Public allowed to buy shares in Satour.

Individual: Eben van Wyk

Category: Public service - local government Submiss.No. 38 Summary: *Recommend that the original be read.*

> Summarized by Anwar Khan and Hilton Gallant.

CONSTITUTIONAL ASSEMBLY

10/4

THEME COMMITTEE THREE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT

FRAMEWORK FOR SUBMISSIONS ON FINANCIAL AND FISCAL RELATIONS

1. CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLES

With regard to the submissions for this block recourse should be had to a number of Constitutional Principles, *inter alia*,

- (a) Principle 20: The allocation of powers between different levels of government should be made on a basis which is conducive to financial viability at each level of government and to effective public administration
- (b) Principle 25: The National Government and the Provincial Government should have fiscal powers and functions which will be defined in the Constitution. The framework for local government referred to in Principle 24 (which requires a framework for local government powers, functions and structures to be set out in the Constitution) shall make provision for appropriate fiscal powers and functions for different categories of local government.
- (c) Principle 26: Every level of government shall have a constitutional right to an equitable share of revenue collected nationally so as to ensure that provinces and local governments are able to provide basic services
- (d) Principle 27: The Financial and Fiscal Commission in which each province shall be represented shall recommend equitable fiscal and financial allocations to the provincial and local governments from revenue collected nationally after taking into account the national interest, economic disparity between the provinces

2. FISCAL AFFAIRS

<u>Question 1</u>: To what extent (and if so why) should the Constitution restrict the capacity of provinces to levy taxes?